

Joanna Tuckwell

12

**From:** Kirsty Grant  
**Sent:** Wednesday, 14 May 2008 8:03 a.m.  
**To:** Teresa Williams  
**Cc:** David Bayvel; Erin Rose; 'suvi van smit'; Joanna Tuckwell  
**Subject:** RE: OIA request - AWINZ

Teresa

I can confirm that David and I do not have anything on AWINZ that is not in FCS.

There is another section within FCS that relates to DD-G fortnightly updates to which we have provided Barry and the Minister with updates on AWINZ. There have been four of these updates since 2007 and I can print them if you need them.

The only emails I, personally, have had with Neil Wells is with regard to operational matters, e.g. statistics, instruments of appointments for their inspectors and a new identity card. This correspondence sits in my email folders. If you want these I can print them. However, none of these relate to Grace Hayden.

Regards  
Kirsty

---

**From:** Joanna Tuckwell  
**Sent:** Tuesday, 13 May 2008 7:30 p.m.  
**To:** Teresa Williams  
**Cc:** David Bayvel; Erin Rose; Kirsty Grant; 'suvi van smit'  
**Subject:** RE: OIA request

Hi Teresa

Thanks for your message.

I am attaching one memo about AWINZ from me to George Capes, from my personal cabinet (simply because I couldn't think where else to file it at the time!). To the best of my knowledge, all the rest of our team's electronic material relating to AWINZ is in FCS. Neither Roger nor I have anything else relevant in our personal cabinets. I am copying this to Kirsty to ask her to check that she hasn't done anything for David that may not already be in FCS (although I am confident that that won't be the case).

The link to our team's files in FCS is: <http://fcs.maf.govt.nz/webtop/drl/objectid/0b0101b3802f9ea2>

We do have a hard copy file relating to AWINZ, which of course includes material relating to Grace Haden's complaints. I have left the current file on my desk, as I am away from the office for the next eight days. The current file dates back to 2004, which should cover the relevant period. If for any reason you need anything earlier, please contact my colleague Margaret Handscomb, to access it for you from archives.

I will run an email extender search when I am back in the office next week, to check that I haven't deleted any emails from Mr Wells without printing them for our hard-copy file.

MAF Policy also has files relating to AWINZ, but again, these pre-date the relevant period (they mostly relate to the establishment of AWINZ and its attainment of approved organisation status under the Animal Welfare Act).

There is, of course, a considerable volume of information relating to the OIA request (letters from Mrs Haden, and draft ministerial responses), held by MAFBNZ's ministerials co-ordinator, Suvi van Smit. I am copying this email to Suvi for her awareness, and so that she may be able to begin compiling (or at least tagging) relevant material. I don't have an electronic version of Mr Wells' OIA, though, so perhaps you can forward that to Suvi?

In terms of information provided previously to Mr Wells, I can't recall providing any written information from or concerning Grace Haden, although I may have forwarded one or two of her very early emails for Mr Wells' awareness/comment/response. Mr Wells has of course received a considerable volume of correspondence from Mrs Haden in his own right, but we have tended to exchange updates (eg at relationship management meetings) on the fact that OIAs have been received etc, rather than copies of actual correspondence. Notes of such exchanges will be recorded in the liaison meeting minutes or my file notes on our team's hard copy file. I do recall sending Mr Wells one draft ministerial response relating to the audit, on which we offered him the opportunity to comment, earlier this year. Erin is aware of this one as she provided peer review of the draft response.

In terms of responding to Mr Wells' OIA request, I don't think our team would have any problem in principle with releasing any of the material on our file, subject to CAR's assessment of the appropriate criteria for release/withholding of information under the OIA being met.

I am happy to discuss this further, if you wish, when I am back in the office on Thursday week. Hopefully the information in this email helps in the meantime.

Regards  
Joanna

<< File: (M) MAF Legal - further advice on AWINZ 28.11.06\_2.doc >>

---

**From:** Teresa Williams  
**Sent:** Tuesday, 13 May 2008 11:31 a.m.  
**To:** Joanna Tuckwell  
**Cc:** David Bayvel; Erin Rose  
**Subject:** OIA request

Hi Joanna

David tells me that he has briefed you on the recent OIA from Neil Wells. David has a copy but if he hasn't passed on a copy then I could pop one in the mail.

In planning the approach to the OIA we recognise the need to ensure our response is appropriate and that we have applied valid judgement in determining any material which we may choose not to release.

First we need to ensure we understand the entirety of what we have within MAF. In particular, we need to look at all repositories of information not just FMS. For example, we need to capture any material which may reside on local drives rather than in FMS. We would therefore appreciate your help in two matters:-

1. is there any material relevant to the OIA, held by Animal Welfare, outside FMS. If so, please alert us to this material and either commit to an appropriate timescale for putting it within FMS or allow us access to the drives so we can apply the same search criteria as we are using on FMS
2. can you suggest any other area of MAF that may hold information relevant to the OIA, outside FMS?

Secondly, we need to recognise that the OIA covers quite a long period of time (from 1 December 2005) and that during that time MAF may have provided material to Neil Wells which would now be within the scope of his recent OIA. We need to recognise what has already been provided to him so that our choices around release of information are informed choices. It would be very helpful if you could consider this question from the Animal Welfare team perspective. Very happy to have a discussion about this but perhaps worth you spending some time considering the question first. I appreciate that few people would have anticipated that we would find ourselves in this situation

Many thanks  
Teresa

**Joanna Tuckwell**

14

**From:** Joanna Tuckwell  
**Sent:** Tuesday, 10 June 2008 11:42 a.m.  
**To:** Roger Poland  
**Subject:** FW: AWD input to MAF response to AWINZ/Hoadley OIA request

Hi Roger

FYI, as discussed

Thanks  
Joanna

---

**From:** Joanna Tuckwell  
**Sent:** Tuesday, 10 June 2008 10:58 a.m.  
**To:** Erin Rose  
**Cc:** David Bayvel; Teresa Williams; Belita Pereira; 'sui van smit'  
**Subject:** AWD input to MAF response to AWINZ/Hoadley OIA request

Hi Erin

Just a quick note to confirm AWD's input to MAF's response to the refined OIA request for background leading to the CAR audit of AWINZ.

I have left with you our file, with relevant correspondence (in particular, exchanges between George Capes and me) marked for your reference. While you indicated that it is intended to respond on the basis that the Minister commissioned the audit, I think the file shows that this initiative really came from MAF. Certainly, as we discussed, Mrs Haden's ongoing correspondence was the basis for the actions taken. In particular, Mrs Haden's letter dated 29 June? July? 2007 (with numerous attachments) - tagged in the file - escalated the matter to the point where we considered that MAF needed to be able to provide assurance to the Minister that AWINZ's accountability and management arrangements continued to meet the requirements of the Act.

At the same time, given the small number of approved organisations in New Zealand (only two), AWD saw this as an opportunity to review current arrangements and make improvements where appropriate. This was reflected in the draft replies to Mrs Haden, prepared by MAF for the Minister. Finally, I have tagged some records of meetings where information about MAF's position was provided to Mr Wells.

I understand that you may not have a copy of Mrs Haden's letter of 29 June to hand. If not, MAFBNZ's ministerial officers (Sui van Smit and Belita Pereira) should be able to make one available to you. I am copying this email to Sui and Belita for information and so that they can locate a copy of the relevant correspondence, if needed.

I understand that there will be an opportunity for AWD to provide peer review of the draft response to Mrs Hoadley and we would be happy to assist with that.

Hope this helps  
Joanna

OFFICIAL INFORMATION ACT